

QUALIFICATION BASED SELECTION - (BROOKS ACT)

**FOR
CM@RISK**

Prepared by

Joe Z. Ramirez

Manager, Contracts and Procurement

Bus & Paratransit Conference



QUALIFICATION BASED SELECTION - (BROOKS ACT) FOR CM@RISK

Selection Criteria Requirements

In accordance with ARS § 34-603C2(c):

“All selection criteria . . . shall be factors that demonstrate competence and qualifications for the type of professional services or construction services included in the procurement.”

In accordance with ARS § 34-603C2(d):

“If the agent will hold interviews . . .state that interviews will be held . . .”

QUALIFICATION BASED SELECTION - (BROOKS ACT) FOR CM@RISK)

- Separate contracts for design and construction
- CM selected during design, provides preconstruction services
- CM becomes GC for construction
- Work by owner-approved subs

Selection Process Overview

- Criteria based on qualifications and experience
- Price considered during contract negotiation
- Creates focus on quality and value, not price
- Rewards success through teamwork and proactive behavior
- Elevates construction to service profession
- Creates a “win-win-win” environment

Contractor Participation on Selection Panel

- Statute requires “one person who is a senior management employee of a licensed contractor”
- Owners should keep list of volunteers to participate on panels
- Try to match person with similar type projects
- Very, very helpful for contractors to sit on selection panels
- Helps them see process from the other side of table
- Helps public owner in “selling” selection to industry at large
- Strongly recommend to contractors to volunteer for panels

Best Practices During Selection Process

- Limited SOQ Page Counts
- Presubmittal Conference
- Discretely Weighted Selection Criteria
- Use of Rankings for Final Selection
- Interviews with Key Project Team Members
- Limited Owner Direction on Interviews
- Debrief for Unsuccessful Shortlisted Proposers
- Contractor Participation on Selection Panel
- Thorough Due Diligence with Previous Owners

Limited SOQ Page Counts

- Page count for most projects limited to 10-12
- Major projects (>\$100M) could go up to 15 pages
- Limiting pages reduces staff time and cost to prepare
- Limits owner staff time and cost to review
- Better teams should be able to tell their story concisely, focus on what is important
- Results in better outcomes, panel better able to narrow in on best qualified firm

Selection Criteria Examples

- Experience and past performance of firm
- Experience and past performance of assigned individuals
- Experience with delivery method
- Capacity to perform the work
- Subcontracting plan and selection process*
- * Arizona Statutory requirement

Selection Criteria Examples, cont.

- Financial strength and bonding capability
- Management plan, subcontractor relationships and technical capabilities
- Project approach and challenges
- Safety plan and safety record
- Quality assurance plan

Discretely Weighted Selection Criteria

- Arizona Law requires “state the selection criteria and relative weight of the selection criteria”
- Some owners show relative weight by listing in descending order of importance
- Good owners provide discretely weighted selection criteria to aid proposers in response
- If Criterion A worth 200 points and Criterion B worth 100 points, spend twice the time on A as B

Sample Evaluation Criteria

- General Information 50 pts
- Experience of Firm 175 pts
- Experience of Key Personnel 225 pts
- Understanding of the Project 250pts
- Quality Control & Safety Programs 100 pts
- Subcontractor Selection Plan 100 pts
- Overall Evaluation of Firm 100 pts
- TOTAL 1,000 pts

Use of Rankings for Final Selection

- For years, Valley Metro had tracked both Panel member Scores and Rankings
- Found that using Scores could be influenced greatly by one individual's results
- Felt that using Rankings were more fair and consistent to reflect Panel recommendation
- Research has shown Rankings to be preferred scoring method

Presubmittal Conference

- Highly recommended, except for small, straightforward or repetitive projects
- Allows proposers to hear from the owner's staff, understand importance
- Owner should only restate information contained in the RFQ –NO NEW INFO
- Recommend attendance optional, not mandatory
- Owner should encourage questions, few asked

Interviews with Key Project Team Members

- Statute requires owner to state in RFQ if interviews will be held
- RFQ must state selection criteria and relative weight used to select firms to be interviewed
- RFQ may state selection criteria and relative weight to be used in interview and for final selection
- Recommendation: Restate criteria in Interview letter
- Interview selection criteria may be different than original criteria

Limited Owner Direction on Interviews

- Owner should resist being overly directive in interview process
- Owner might suggest who should attend, as in “Owner would like to hear for team members who will work on project.”
- Allow them to make business decision how best to win the work
- If owner of the company wants to come and talk extensively, you should let him or her do so
- Probably won’t be successful, but it’s their decision
- Don’t take on their liability for success
- My recommendation, other owners may not agree

Debrief for Unsuccessful Shortlisted Proposers

- Good public owners owe unsuccessful proposers an effective debrief of their efforts
- What did they do well, what not so well
- Should be reflective of panel member scores where need to improve
- During selection panel meetings, panel members should provide feedback to facilitator to use for debrief

Qualifications Based Selection

Valley Metro utilizes a QBS method to procure various professional service type contract:

- Single Projects
 - Design Services for Light Rail Extensions
 - 1st Step for Construction Manager at Risk
- Multiple Disciplined Consultant Contracts
 - Planning and Community Relations Support
 - Program Management/Construction Management
 - General Consulting Services

Qualifications Based Selection – (Brooks Act)

Questions?

Thank You!

